

Office of the Director
50 W. Gay St.
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040
(614) 645-8591
(614) 645-6245 (FAX)

Planning Division
50 W. Gay St.
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040
(614) 645-8664
(614) 645-1483 (FAX)

Downtown Commission
Daniel J. Thomas (Staff)
Urban Design Manager
(614) 645-8404
djthomas@columbus.gov

DOWNTOWN COMMISSION RESULTS

Tuesday, June 24, 2014

50 W. Gay Street, (Beacon Building) Conference Room B – 1st Floor

I. Attendance

Present: Steve Wittmann, Michael Brown, Kyle Katz, Robert Loversidge, Danni Palmore

Absent: Otto Beatty Jr., Mike Lusk

Term Expired, Reappointment In Process: Tedd Hardesty, Jana Maniace

City Staff: Daniel Thomas, Kevin Wheeler

II. Approval of the May 27, 2014 Downtown Commission Meeting Results

Move to approve (5-0)

III. Review for Certificate of Appropriateness

Case #1 815 -14

Address: 400 W. Nationwide Boulevard

East Buggy Works

Applicant: and Owner: Nationwide Realty Investors

Design Professional: 360 Architecture

Request CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness for:

- Partial demolition of the eastern portion of the Buggy Works
- Conversion of the remaining buildings to office (west) and parking (east)
- New glass connector – entrance between office and garage
- Capping the office portion of the project with new brick – retaining the interior brick surface, and insulating the office.
- Surface parking, primarily in the rear.
- A small plaza at the corner of Nationwide Blvd. and Huntington Park Ln. Includes a small amount of parking.

Discussion

Brian Ellis - Nationwide has been in the Arena District for going on 17 years. The Buggyworks Building has presented considerable challenge and opportunity. The historic building was built in 1902. Two buildings are connected that are interconnected that are too big together to be economically viable. The office building will be a unique offering heretofore not available in the Arena District.

Significant portions of the 1950's buildings will be carved out to free up the older building. What is left with the 50's building has bay dimensions that are ideal for parking. Exterior slope allows for entrances on a lower and upper level at two different locations. No interior ramps are needed. The upper floor will be taken off. The second floor will become a roof. There will be a total of 170+/- parking spaces, in and outside. The brick from the older building on the east façade will be reexposed. There's a lot of damage to the brick. We've investigated the options of cleaning and they are expensive. There are also energy and tenant comfort considerations. Initially interior insulation was considered. However, the most attractive part of the building is the interior brick wall. The atmosphere is also embellished by the timbers and wood ceilings. Conclusion was made to insulate on the exterior by having a second brick exterior. Good views of downtown will be created.

The retaining wall on Nationwide Blvd. will be the same material as what was use for the FBI Building across the street. The garage building will be reglazed.

Residents of the Buggyworks condo expressed concern with the mechanical screening on the roof and it's potential to block views to downtown. They wondered if there were any alternatives to full blockage and consolidate the location of mechanical equipment on the roof. What about not having a continuous screen or a lower screen at portions? A. - The screen wall is 13 ft. and pretty much needs to be on the roof. It will be as consolidated and contained as we can make it. Locations of equipment right now are based on providing efficiency. RL – Sections thru west and east Buggyworks buildings is advocated. Study the whole thing in sections (west, east, parking and ballpark, if necessary). Buggyworks showing view relationships would be helpful. Also look at the view from the roof top terraces. A. – Concern for extraordinary compromises. Residents – what would substantial mean? Can an estimate be done? Moving screen wall in one way or another wouldn't matter. A. – I don't agree with that. We can take a look at it. Who would pay for changes? We would like to move forward with demolition – that will take time. We will come back in 30 days Will define substantial in numbers, The more you move it to the east, the more the screen wall is in play to pedestrians and those at Huntington Park. Glass entry was looked at.

SW. – Move on to demolition. We seem to be in agreement with that. Let's move on. Landscaping is important – can't read this one. Have a larger scale. KK – Signage. Don't know yet. Parking lot light will be FBI Bldg. type and entry lighting. Landscaping similar. Pervious pavers such as Flats on Vine.

RL – How would Firestone Alley be change? No vestige of the old Buggywork on the east side, just another nice new building. I fundamentally disagree that you can't make the building comfortable without leaving the existing exterior brick alone. I've done it in practice for many years. Concern about the loss of the industrial feel. Don't have a solution for the granulation. What's the condition of the brick on the east side. I don't know why you are taking the elevator off. Concern about taking all of the character out. Insulating the outside of the building might cause problems. Architect – following the City's initiative about having energy efficiency. Have to bring it up to current code. Firestone Alley is shared use and will largely be left alone. The edge of the building will have a granite curb, it will not match the western side, which has trees and patios on the other side. SW – The energy efficiency is something you have to deal with. SW – Suggests that the approval be broken up. KK – Move to allow for demolition. RL – assume that the project is moving

forward. (5-0) Landscaping, signage, lighting, A. minimal up lighting of trees, some highlight lighting of buildings. SW – bring back examples. MB – do we need to vote on anything? A. Would like to know that there is commitment from the Commission Resident – is there any way to retain more of the old character. A. – we will match the brick as best we can. It will be a nice newish brick building on the exterior and a great older brick building on the interior that is energy efficient. SW – agree that landscaping is adequate. SW – granulate is a mess, a problem. RL - I move approval of the project subject to signage, lighting, Firestone alley details, screen wall analysis and view studies

Result

- Motion to approve demolition of those portions of the building complex indicated in the plan. (5-0)
- Motion to approve of the project subject to signage, lighting, Firestone Alley details, screen wall analysis and view studies (5-0)

Case #2 816 -14

Address: 290 Nationwide Boulevard

Applicant: Nationwide Realty Investors

Property Owner: NWD 240 Nationwide LLC c/o Nationwide Realty Investors

Design Professional: MKSK

Request CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness approval for a plaza at the corner of Nationwide Blvd. and Neil Ave.

Discussion

SW – selection of trees are serviceberries – isn't there an opportunity to be more dramatic?

A.- this is a single stem, taller variety. MB – loves the plaza but finds the kiosk objectionable. A – It's the kiosk that has been previously approved elsewhere. Signage was discussed.

Result

Motion to approve (5-0)

Case #3 817 -14

Address: 358 E. Mt. Vernon Ave.

Applicant and Design Professional: Jonathan Barnes Architecture and Design

Property Owner: Ballet Met

Request CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness for the conversion of 358 Mt. Vernon Ave. from warehouse to apartments. Specifically:

- Removal of brick and smaller windows that filled formerly large windows.
- Replacement with large multi-pane windows of an industrial character
- Tuck pointing and other surface repair

- New entrances

Discussion

Open the original window opening. The back (northern) and western elevation will have new windows the size of the original and will be painted. Signage and lighting – will come back for. Windows will be similar to those that are in the Julian. SW – I'd like to lock in what we are approving on windows. These will be apartments. Parking will be on ground in the rear. Mostly interior improvements – i.e. no sidewalks. There will be a grill in the windows – a PTACK – painted black. It allows for individual units so there won't have to be rooftop units. There will not likely be a rooftop deck. RL – there is not much to approve...SW – basically just new windows. Brick exterior stays the same. Colors are specified. Window is provided. A – we will come back with signage and lighting and anything else. Not much opportunity for landscaping – maybe planters. A – I can come back to show the specs on the railings out front, whatever details we have. SW – come back with the specifics on the windows and railings. A – we don't know how many units.

Result

Move to approve. The applicant will return with: window specifications, lighting, railing specifications (5-0)

Case #4 818 -14

Address: 150 Gay Street

Applicant and Property Owner: Continental Real Estate

Installer: Capital City Awning Co.

Request CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the installation of "sails" in the plaza of 150 E. Gay Street.

Discussion

Shade sail to provide more shelter and comfort. These have been successfully installed elsewhere in the country. Some changes in color are going to be made, yellow instead of red. A building permit will be necessary. These will be seasonal.

Result

Motion to approve (5-0)

Case #5 819 -14

Address: 360 E. Long St.

Applicant and Property Owner: 360 East Long LLC Brian Savage, Debbie Rosenthal

Design Professional: Brent Racer

Request CC3359.05(C)1)

Certificate of Appropriateness for improvements to a combination three story brick building and one story commercial building.

This was presented as a conceptual review in April of this year.

Discussion

Applicant and owners presented. Discussions have taken place with the Edwards Co. in terms of coordinating efforts across the street. KK – what color would the EFIS be? A. – Haven’t determined that, looking for guidance from the Commission. Right now it is a tannish color, we are thinking about doing a neutral color and darker green or black for trim. SW – Where does the ceiling go on that, this seems funny. The glass on the brick portion should go up to where the columns are. On the retail section possibly move the glass up higher. Where is the existing parapet? Is this an existing header? A. – We are waiting to see who are tenants will be, right now we are thinking about three. RL – make the upper portion less massive with awnings. Paint the EFIS out so that it recedes and make the awnings more pronounced. SW – I’m not sure that I would make the panels match. Need to see an exact drawing of what you are going to do. I would like to see the materials. Insulated spandrel panel – what does that mean? Picture from New Jersey. SW – that glass goes all the way down to the bottom. SW – I prefer the straight glass over the panels. A. Concern with glass being broken into. RL – doesn’t mind panels. KK – Do something that works. SW – I can see pieces of what we are being asked to approve, but it doesn’t come together. You’ve got the bones, but you need to have it finished. We want to know what the windows are. A. the windows aren’t happening now. (upstairs windows – will come back). SW – Bring us a drawing of exactly what you want us to approve. Glass above, awning to take the weight of the EIFS, KK – think about signage for your tenants. RL – you’re not want to do big signs on the EFIS area, do them on the awnings. SW – don’t do just one long awning. A. Maybe over the storefront doors. RL – All of these decisions have to get made. We have no objections to this project. I think that it’s great. RL – Motion to approve the project subject to coming back with details and samples. Suggest that the architect attend next month.

Result

Motion to approve interior work. Exterior details to come back next month. (5-0)

V. Request for Certificate of Appropriateness for Advertising Mural (Temporary Graphic)

Case #6 820-14

Columbus Dispatch ad mural

66 S. Third Street

Applicant: Clear Channel Outdoor

Property Owner: Capitol Square Ltd.

Columbus Dispatch

Design Professional: Clear Channel

Request:

Design review and approval for installation of vinyl mesh advertising murals to be located on the north elevation at 66 S. Third St. Proposed mural – Columbus Dispatch – “Discover a taste of summer”. The Downtown Commission has previously approved numerous murals at this location, the latest being for the Columbus Dispatch, Bicentennial Park. CC3359.07(D)

This is a campaign highlighting Dispatch photography. The ad murals will go up in fairly

rapid order. The campaign was initially approved by the Commission at their February meeting. The applicant wishes to extend the campaign.

Dimensions of mural: 35'W x 20'H Two dimensional, non lit

Term of installation: Seeking approval from July 9 through the end of August, 2014.

Area of mural: 700 sf

Approximate % of area that is text: 4.5%

Result

Motion to approve (5-0)

Case #7 809-14

Honda Fit ad mural

154 N. Third Street

Applicant: CBS Outdoor

Property Owner: Schottenstein Property Group

Request:

Design review and approval for installation of a vinyl mesh advertising mural to be located on the south elevation of 154 N. Third St. Proposed mural is for Lindsay Honda Fit. This would be an inaugural installation of an ad mural on the south façade (the north façade has had numerous murals). CC3359.07(D).

Dimensions of mural: 34'H x 95'W Two dimensional, non lit

Term of installation: Seeking approval from June 2 through November 10, 2014.

Area of mural: 3230sf

Approximate % of area that is text: 16%

This application was tabled last month, results are included in the packet. The resubmission reduces the text percentage from 19.2% to 16%. The May and the current submissions are also included in this packet.

Discussion

RL – We shouldn't be accepting applications that have text percentage this large. We've reiterated to the client about the Commission's criteria SW – it's just a billboard, it is not what we are looking for. It looks well over 16%. KK – it is just not well done. A – the applicant has been insistent. Is there any way? SW – If you are just doing an extension of your billboard campaign. SW – start over, be clever, dramatic reduction. I'm sorry

Result

RL - I move for approval and ask for a voice vote. (0-5) Motion fails

Case #8 810-14

Lindsay Acura ad mural

123 E. Spring Street

Applicant: CBS Outdoor

Property Owner: Spring Street LLC

Request:

Design review and approval for installation of a vinyl mesh advertising mural to be located on the east elevation of 123 E. Spring St. Proposed mural is for Lindsay Acura. The Downtown Commission approved a Captain Morgan ad mural in February 2014. CC3359.07(D).

Dimensions of mural: 15'H x 35'W Two dimensional, non lit

Term of installation: Seeking approval from. July 2 through November 10, 2014.

Area of mural: 525sf

Approximate % of area that is text: 11.8%

The Lindsay Acura ad mural was initially presented to the Downtown Commission last month (May) and was tabled. The current submission represents a reduction of text percentage from 20% to 11.8%. (both current and May submissions are included in the packet).

Discussion

SW - It's still a billboard. A – we feel that this one has more merit. The cars, in and of themselves are art. The lines of the cars and the efforts that went into design.

Result

Move for approval and ask for a voice vote. (0-5) Motion fails

Case #9 821-14

Help us dot the i - ad mural

Address: 34 N. High Street **South Elevation**

Applicant: Orange Barrel Media

Property Owner: Thirty Four Corp

Design Professional: Orange Barrel Media

Request:

Design review and approval for the installation of a vinyl mesh advertising mural to be located on the south elevation at 34 N. High Street. Proposed mural is for "Help us dot the i". There have been numerous ads as murals at this location, the latest being for a Share the Road ad mural. CC3359.07(D).

Dimensions of mural: 20'W x 33'H, two dimensional, non lit

Term of installation: Seeking approval from July 15 through September 30, 2014.

Area of mural: 660 sf

Approximate % of area that is text: 3%

Discussion

Community affair program. A new director. Based on vintage baseball cards. KK – can you even read the lettering at the bottom? SW – could you move the "Help us dot the I" just a scad? "Make the best band even better" is not even readable MB – all that matters is really getting the reader to reach the web site. A – I'll check with the client. KK – just the Block O. RL – It's a good ad mural, just a little complicated.

Result

Motion to accept with changes as discussed: Move down “Help us dot the i” down slightly; eliminate “Make the best band even better”; have strictly the block O. (5-0)

Case #10 822-14**Help us dot the i - ad mural**

Address: 34 N. High Street – North Elevation

Applicant: Orange Barrel Media

Property Owner: Thirty Four Corp

Design Professional: Orange Barrel Media

Request:

Design review and approval for the installation of a vinyl mesh advertising mural to be located on the north elevation at 34 N. High Street. Proposed mural is for “Help us dot the i”. There have been numerous as murals at this location, the latest being for a Square O ad mural. CC3359.07(D).

Dimensions of mural: 20’W x 33’H, two dimensional, non lit

Term of installation: Seeking approval from July 15 through September 30, 2014.

Area of mural: 660 sf

Approximate % of area that is text: 3.7%

Result

Motion to accept with changes as discussed: Move down “Help us dot the i” down slightly; eliminate “Make the best band even better”; have strictly the block O. (5-0)

VI. Business / Discussion**Public Forum**

Staff Certificates of Appropriateness have been issued since last meeting (May 27, 2014)

1. CCAD Canzani Center – Roofing
2. 236 E. Town St. – Graphics – Franklin Univ.
3. 51 E. Gay St. – The Carvery - Sign – Restaurant
4. Franklin County Juvenile Detention vent hoods
5. 118 E. Main St. – bick up side windows – building code violation
6. 360 S. Third St. – United Way banner
7. 215 N. Fourth St. – Wolf’s Ridge – Rear windows, doors
8. Oak, Grant – Window replacements
9. 303 S. Grant Ave. – Roofing
10. 175 S. Third St. – Sprint antenna
11. 250 Civic Center – replace chiller
12. Apple – 285 N. Front St. – Orange Barrel

If you have questions concerning this agenda, please contact Daniel Thomas, Urban Design Manager, Planning Division at 645-8404.